THE SCOTTISH HISTORICAL REVIEW

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS LTD.
Parkside Works Edinburgh 9
36 Park Street London W1
312 Flinders Street Melbourne C1
302-304 Barclays Bank Building
Commissioner and Kruis Streets
Johannesburg

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS (CANADA) LTD.
91-93 Wellington Street West Toronto 1

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS
19 East 47th Street New York 17

SOCIÉTÉ FRANÇAISE D'EDITIONS NELSON
97 rue Monge Paris 5

THE SCOTTISH HISTORICAL REVIEW

Volume Thirty-Eighth

EDINBURGH
THOMAS NELSON & SONS, LTD.
1959

THE
SCOTTISH
HISTORICAL
REVIEW

Index

PAGE

Aberdeen Council Letters, Vol. V, ed. by Louise B. Taylor, reviewed by C. A. Malcolm - - - 58
Aberdeen, Early Records of the Burgh of, ed. by W. Croft Dickinson, reviewed by George S. Pryde 47
Accessions to the Register House, 1958, note by Sir James Fergusson - - - - - - - 169
Accounts of the Masters of Works, Vol. I, ed. by Henry M. Paton, reviewed by H. M. Colvin - - 63
Act of the Head Court: Elgin-Forres Election, 1612, note by W. A. McNeill - - - - 87
Adam of Dryburgh, by James Bulloch, reviewed by G. S. M. Walker - - - - - - 148
Alexander Gordon, by Ian A. Porter, reviewed by Douglas Guthrie - 75
Ancient and Historical Monuments of Selkirkshire, reviewed by J. R. C. Hamilton - - - - - 58
Anderson, M. L., ed., *The James Carmichaell Collection of Proverbs in Scots*, reviewed by David Murison - - - - - - 145
Androw Myllar, by Thomas Rae, reviewed by William Beattie - 77
Arbella Stuart, by P. M. Handover, reviewed by A. J. A. Malkiewicz 160
Ashley, Anne, *The Church in the Isle of Man*, reviewed by Archibald A. M. Duncan - - - - - 79
Atholl, Duchess of, *Working Partnership*, reviewed by John B. S. Gilfillan - - - - - 157
Ayrshire Archaeological and Natural History Society Collections, reviewed by John Imrie - - - 136

Baillie, John, review by (*The Christian Doctrine of History*) - 151
Balfour-Melville, E. W. M., review by (*The Common Man in the Great Civil War*) - - 83
Baron Hume's Lectures, Vol. VI, ed. by G. Campbell H. Paton, reviewed by G. A. Montgomery - 73
Beattie, William, review by (*Androw Myllar*) - - - 77
Black Rood of Scotland, The, an Allusion to in 1346, note by E. L. G. Stones - - - - - 174
Book of the Old Edinburgh Club, Vol. XXIX, reviewed by Alexander Law - - - - - - 67
Boswell in Search of a Wife, ed. by Frank Bradby and Frederick A. Pottle, reviewed by D. B. Horn - - - - - - - 71
Bradby, Frank, and Pottle, Frederick A., eds., *Boswell in Search of a Wife*, reviewed by D. B. Horn 71
British Paper Industry, The, by D. C. Coleman, reviewed by A. J. Youngson - - - - - 139
Brown, A. L., review by (*Selected Historical Essays of F. W. Maitland*) - - - - - - 148
Bulloch, James, *Adam of Dryburgh*, reviewed by G. S. M. Walker - 148
Burn, A. R., review by (*Roman and Native in North Britain*) - 66
Bushnell, Nelson S., *William Hamilton of Bangour*, reviewed by W. Douglas Simpson - - 77

Cam, Helen M., ed., *Selected Historical Essays of F. W. Maitland*, reviewed by A. L. Brown - - - - - - - 148
Campbell, A. D., review by (*The Condition of the Working Class in England*) - - - - - 138
Campbell, J. L., review by (*The Scottish Highlands: A Short History*) - - - - - - 70
Christian Doctrine of History, The, by John McIntyre, reviewed by John Baillie - - - - - 151
Chronicle of Walter of Guisborough, ed. by Harry Rothwell, reviewed by John Taylor - - 61
Church in the Isle of Man, The, by Anne Ashley, reviewed by Archibald A. M. Duncan - - - 79
Clark, M., ed., *Sources of Australian History*, reviewed by George Shepperson - - - - - - 84
Coleman, D. C., *The British Paper Industry*, reviewed by A. J. Youngson - - - - - 139
Colvin, H. M., review by (*Accounts of the Masters of Works*, Vol. I) - 63
Common Man, The, in the Great Civil War, by C. V. Wedgwood, reviewed by E. W. M. Balfour-Melville - - - - - - 83
Condition of the Working Class in England, by F. Engels, trans. and ed. byW. O. Henderson and W. H. Chaloner, reviewed by A. D. Campbell - - - 138

PAGE

Davis, G. R. C., *Mediaeval Cartularies in Great Britain*, additions to - - - - - - - - 172
Dickinson, W. Croft, ed., *Early Records of the Burgh of Aberdeen*, reviewed by George S. Pryde - 47
Dingwall Burgh Politics and the Parliamentary Franchise in the Eighteenth Century, by W. Ferguson - - - - - - 89
Donaldson, Gordon, review by (*History of Trinity House of Leith*) - - - - - - 153
Dunbar, William: Poems, ed. by James Kinsley, reviewed by Douglas Young - - - - 10
Duncan, Archibald A. M., review by (*The Church in the Isle of Man*) 79
Dunstaffnage Castle and the Stone of Destiny, by W. Douglas Simpson, reviewed by Leslie Grahame MacDougall - - 154

Early Records of the Burgh of Aberdeen, ed. by W. Croft Dickinson, reviewed by Goerge S. Pryde - 47
Edinburgh Bibliographical Society Transactions, Vol. III, Part IV, reviewed by L. W. Sharp - - 162
Engels, F., *The Condition of the Working Class in England*, trans. and ed. by W. O. Henderson and W. H. Chaloner, reviewed by A. D. Campbell - - - 138

Ferguson, W., Dingwall Burgh Politics and the Parliamentary Franchise in the Eighteenth century, 89; reviews by (*History of the Cameronians—Scottish Rifles*), 149, (*A Scottish History for Today*) - - - - - - 80
Fergusson, Sir James, note by (Accessions to the Register House, 1958), 169; *The Kennedys* reviewed by Sir Iain Moncreiffe 165
Finlayson, C. P., note by (A Volume associated with John Knox) - - - - - - - 170
Franco-Scottish and Franco-Norwegian Treaties of 1295, The, by Ranald Nicholson - - - 114

Gaffney, Victor, Summer Shealings 20
Gilfillan, John B. S., review by (*Working Partnership*) - - - 157
Gould, Ian, and Thompson, John, *A Scottish History for Today*, reviewed by W. Ferguson - 80

PAGE

Grahams, The, by John Stewart, reviewed by Sir Iain Moncreiffe 165
Guisborough, Walter, Chronicle of, ed. by Harry Rothwell, reviewed by John Taylor - - 61
Guthrie, Douglas, review by (*Alexander Gordon*) - - - 75

Hamilton, J. R. C., review by (*Ancient and Historical Monuments of Selkirkshire*) - - - 53
Handover, P. M., *Arbella Stuart*, reviewed by A. J. A. Malkiewicz - - - - - - - 160
Hay, Denys, review by (*Historical Studies*) - - - - - - 139
Henderson, Keith, and Piggott, Stuart, *Scotland before History*, reviewed by T. G. E. Powell - 72
Historical Studies, ed. by T. Desmond Williams, reviewed by Denys Hay - - - - - 139
History of the Cameronians (Scottish Rifles), by S. H. F. Johnston, reviewed by W. Ferguson - 149
History of Trinity House of Leith, by John Mason, reviewed by Gordon Donaldson - - - 153
Horn, D. B., review by (*Boswell in Search of a Wife*) - - - 71
'Huseby' System in Orkney, The, by Asgaut Steinnes - - - 36

Imrie, John, review by (*Ayrshire Archaeological and Natural History Society Collections*) - - 136
Jacobite General, The, by Katherine Tomasson, reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - - - - 141
James Carmichaell Collection of Proverbs in Scots, ed. by M. L. Anderson, reviewed by David Murison - - - - - 145
Johnston, S. H. F., *The History of the Cameronians (Scottish Rifles)*, reviewed by W. Ferguson - - 149

Kennedys, The, by Sir James Fergusson, reviewed by Sir Iain Moncreiffe - - - - - 165
Kermack, W. R., *The Scottish Highlands: A Short History*, reviewed by J. L. Campbell - - - 70
King James IV of Scotland, by R. L. Mackie, reviewed by J. D. Mackie 133
Kinsley, James, ed., *William Dunbar: Poems*, reviewed by Douglas Young - - - - - - 10

PAGE

Knox, John, A volume associated with, note by C. P. Finlayson - 170

Law, Alexander, review by (*Book of the Old Edinburgh Club*, Vol. XXIX) - - - - - - 67
Legge, M. Dominica, La Piere d' Escoce - - - - - - 109
Leith-Hay, Henrietta, and Lochhead, Marion, *Trustie to the End*, reviewed by Donald E. R. Watt 74
Lochhead, Marion, and Leith-Hay, Henrietta, *Trustie to the End*, reviewed by Donald E. R. Watt 74

MacDougall, Leslie Grahame, review by (*Dunstaffnage Castle and the Stone of Destiny*) - - - 154
McElwee, William, *The Wisest Fool in Christendom*, reviewed by W. A. McNeill - - - - 82
McIntyre, John, *The Christian Doctrine of History*, reviewed by John Baillie - - - - - - 151
Mackie, J. D., review by (*King James IV of Scotland*) - - - 133
Mackie, R. L., *King James IV of Scotland*, reviewed by J. D. Mackie - - - - - - - 133
McNeill, W. A., note by (Act of the Head Court: Elgin-Forres Election, 1612), 87; review by (*The Wisest Fool in Christendom*) - - - - - - - 82
Malcolm, C. A., review by (*Aberdeen Council Letters*, Vol. V) - 58
Malkiewicz, A. J. A., review by (*Arbella Stuart*) - - - - - 160
Mason, John, *History of Trinity House of Leith*, reviewed by Gordon Donaldson - - - - 153
Mechie, Stewart, review by (*Records of the Scottish Church History Society*) - - - - - - 84
Mediaeval Cartularies of Great Britain, by G. R. C. Davis, additions to - - - - - 172
Moncreiffe, Sir Iain, review by (*The Kennedys*; *The Grahams*) 165
Montgomery, G. A., review by (*Baron Hume's Lectures*, Vol. VI) - - - - - - - - 73
Morgan, Edwin, review by (*The Scottish Tradition in Literature*) 159
Muness Castle, by W. Douglas Simpson - - - - - - 1
Murison, David, review by (*The James Carmichaell Collection of Proverbs in Scots*) - - - - 145

PAGE

Nicholas, David, review by (*The Jacobite General*) - - - - 141
Nicholson, Ranald, The Franco-Scottish and Franco-Norwegian Treaties of 1295 - - - - - 114
Northmost Castle of Britain, The, by W. Douglas Simpson - - 1

Orkney, The 'Huseby' System in, by Asgaut Steinnes - - - - 36

Paton, G. Campbell H., ed., *Baron Hume's Lectures*, Vol. VI, reviewed by G. A. Montgomery 73
Paton, Henry M., ed., *Accounts of the Masters of Works, Vol. I*, reviewed by H. M. Colvin - 63
Periodical Notes - - - - 86, 167
Piere d' Escoce, La, by M. Dominica Legge - - - - - - 109
Piggott, Stuart, and Henderson, Keith, *Scotland before Hiatory*, reviewed by T. G. E. Powell - 72
Pottle, Frederick A., and Bradby Frank, eds., *Boswell in Search of a Wife*, reviewed by D. B. Horn - 71
Porter, Ian A., *Alexander Gordon*, reviewed by Douglas Guthrie 75
Powell, T. G. E., review by (*Scotland before History*) - - - - 72
Pryde, George S., review by (*Early Records of the Burgh of Aberdeen*) 47

Rae, Thomas, *Andrew Myllar*, reviewed by William Beattie - 77
Records of the Scottish Church History Society, reviewed by Stewart Mechie - - - - - - - 84
Richmond, I. A., ed., *Roman and Native in North Britain*, reviewed by A. R. Burn - - - - - 66
Roman and Native in North Britain ed. by I. A. Richmond, reviewed by A. R. Burn - - - - - 66
Rothwell, Harry, ed., *Chronicle of Walter of Guisborough*, reviewed by John Taylor - - - - 61

Scotland before History, by Stuart Piggott and Keith Henderson, reviewed by T. G. E. Powell - 72
Scottish Cartularies, note on - - 172
Scottish Highlands: A Short History, by W. R. Kermack, reviewed by J. L. Campbell - - - - - 70
Scottish History for Today, A, by Ian Gould and John Thompson, reviewed by W. Ferguson - - 80

PAGE

Scottish Tradition in Literature, The, by Kurt Wittig, reviewed by Edwin Morgan - - - - - 159
Selected Historical Essays of F. W. Maitland, ed. by Helen M. Cam. reviewed by A. L. Brown - - 148
Selkirkshire, Inventory of the Ancient and Historical Monuments of, reviewed by J. R. C. Hamilton - 53
Sharp, L. W., review by (*Edinburgh Bibliographical Society Transactions*, Vol. III, Part IV) - - 162
Shealings, Summer, by Victor Gaffney - - - - - - 20
Shepperson, George, review by (*Sources of Australian History*) - 84
Simpson, W. Douglas, The Northmost Castle of Britain, 1; *Dunstaffnage Castle and the Stone of Destiny*, reviewed by Leslie Grahame MacDougall 154; review by (*William Hamilton of Bangour*) - - - - - - 77
Sources of Australian History, ed. by M. Clark, reviewed by George Shepperson - - - - - - 84
Steinnes, Asgaut, The 'Huseby' System in Orkney - - - - 36
Stewart, John, *The Grahams*, reviewed by Sir Iain Moncreiffe - 165
Stones, E. L. G., note by (An Allusion to the Black Rood of Scotland in 1346) - - - - 174
Summer Shealings, by Victor Gaffney - - - - - - 20

Taylor, John, review by (*Chronicle of Walter of Guisborough*) - - 61
Taylor, Louise B., ed., *Aberdeen Council Letters*, Vol. V, reviewed by C. A. Malcolm - - - 58
Thompson, John, and Gould, Ian, *A Scottish History for Today*, reviewed by W. Ferguson - - 80
Tomasson, Katherine, *The Jacobite General*, reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - - - - - 141
Transactions of the Dumfriesshire and Galloway Natural History and Antiquarian Society, reviewed 85
Trustie to the End, by Henrietta Leith-Hay and Marion Lochhead. reviewed by Donald E. R. Watt - - - - - - - 74

Walker, G. S. M., review by (*Adam of Dryburgh*) - - - 148
Watt, Donald E. R., review by (*Trustie to the End*) - - - 74
Wedgwood, C. V., *The Common Man in the Great Civil War*, reviewed by E. W. M. Balfour-Melville - - - - - - 83
William Hamilton of Bangour, by Nelson S. Bushnell, reviewed by W. Douglas Simpson - - 77
Williams, T. Desmond, ed., *Historical Studies*, reviewed by Denys Hay - - - - - - - 139
Wisest Fool in Christendom, The, by William McElwee, reviewed by W. A. McNeill - - - - 82
Wittig, Kurt, *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*, reviewed by Edwin Morgan - - - - - - 159
Working Partnership, by the Duchess of Atholl, reviewed by John B. S. Gilfillan - - - - - 157

Young, Douglas, review by (*William Dunbar: Poems*) - - 10
Youngson, A. J, review by (*The British Paper Industry*) - - 139

PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN BY ROBERT CUNNINGHAM AND SONS LTD.,
LONGBANK WORKS, ALVA

Contents

Articles: PAGE

The Northmost Castle of Britain. By W. Douglas Simpson, D. Litt. - - - - - - - - - - - - 1

William Dunbar. By Douglas Young - - - - - - 10

Summer Shealings. By Victor Gaffney - - - - - - 20

The 'Huseby' System in Orkney. By Asgaut Steinnes - 36

Dingwall Burgh Politics and the Parliamentary Franchise in the Eighteenth Century. By W. Ferguson - - 89

La Piere D'Escoce. By M. Dominica Legge - - - - - 109

The Franco-Scottish and Franco-Norwegian Treaties of 1295. By Ranald Nicholson - - - - - - - - - - 114

Reviews:

Early Records of the Burgh of Aberdeen, 1317, 1398-1407. Reviewed by Professor George S. Pryde - - - 47

An Inventory of the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Selkirkshire. Reviewed by J. R. C. Hamilton - - - 53

King James IV of Scotland. Reviewed by Professor Emeritus J. D. Mackie, C.B.E., LL.D. - - - - - - - - 133

Short Notices - - - - - - - - - - - 58, 136

Periodical Notes - - - - - - - - - - - 86, 167

Notes and Comments:

Act of the Head Court: Elgin-Forres Election—12 October 1612. By W. A. McNeill - - - - - - - - 87

Accessions to the Register House, 1958. By Sir James Fergusson, Bart. - - - - - - - - - - - 169

A Volume Associated with John Knox. By C. P. Finlayson 170

Scottish Cartularies - - - - - - - - - - - 172

An Allusion to the Black Rood of Scotland in 1346. By Professor E. L. G. Stones - - - - - - - 174

Contributors to this Volume

Very Rev. Prof. John Baillie
E. W. M. Balfour-Melville
William Beattie
A. L. Brown
A. R. Burn
Prof. A. D. Campbell
J. L. Campbell
H. M. Colvin
Prof. W. Croft Dickinson
Gordon Donaldson
Archibald A. M. Duncan
W. Ferguson
Sir James Fergusson, Bart.
C. P. Finlayson
Victor Gaffney
John B. S. Gilfillan
Douglas Guthrie
J. R. C. Hamilton
Prof. Denys Hay
Prof. D. B. Horn
John Imrie
Alexander Law
M. Dominica Legge
Leslie Grahame MacDougall
Prof. J. D. Mackie
W. A. McNeill
C. A. Malcolm
A. J. A. Malkiewicz
Rev. Stewart Mechie
Sir Iain Moncreiffe, Bart.
Prof. G. A. Montgomery
Edwin Morgan
David Murison
Donald Nicholas
Ranald Nicholson
Prof. T. G. E. Powell
Prof. George S. Pryde
L. W. Sharp
George Shepperson
W. Douglas Simpson
Asgaut Steinnes
Prof. E. L. G. Stones
John Taylor
Rev. G. S. M. Walker
Donald E. R. Watt
Douglas Young
Prof. A. J. Youngson